

APPROVED
JULY 25, 2022

CITY OF WIXOM
49045 PONTIAC TRAIL
SPECIAL PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
WEDNESDAY, JUNE 15, 2022

This meeting was called to order by Chairman Day of the Planning Commission at 6:52 p.m. at which time allegiance was pledged to the American flag.

PRESENT: William Day (Chairman), Phillip Carter (Vice Chairman), Anthony Lawrence, Cheryl Tacy

ABSENT: Excused: Sandro Grossi, Mark Lada, Ray Cousineau

OTHERS: City Manager Steve Brown; Assistant City Manager Drew Benson; Carmine Avantini (CIB Planning); Kelly McIntyre (CIB Planning); Hannah Smith (CIB Planning); Justin Sprague (CIB Planning); Carol Maise (CIB Planning); Ben Carlisle (CWA Planning); Doug Lewan (CWA Planning); and Mona Freiburger (Recording Secretary)

Determination of a Quorum:

A quorum of the Planning Commission was present for this meeting.

Changes or Additions to the Agenda:

None

Approval of Minutes:

None

Correspondence:

None

Call to the Public: (Limited to 5 minutes per speakers, addressing Agenda items on Agenda only)

No public comments.

Old Business:

None

New Business:

1. PLANNING CONSULTANT INTERVIEW - CIB PLANNING

Discussion:

Assistant City Manager Benson introduced the entire interview process.

Chairman Day asked if proponents had seen the questions.

Assistant City Manager Benson introduced Mr. Carmine Avantini. Mr. Avantini introduced the firm including Carol Maise, Kelly McIntyre, Hannah Smith, and Jason Sprague.

Ms. McIntyre spoke on Planning, recent successes, and transition from plan reviewers only to full time zoning administrators. Ms. McIntyre commented the greatest resource is the knowledge and the history through the years. They have transitioned and built their firm to keep going on and on.

Mr. Sprague commented CIB is not a traditional planning and zoning, ongoing consulting company that has 30 to 45 planners; they are planners with excellent and broad experience with relationships across the table. Mr. Sprague indicated Wixom would never be a lower priority.

Mr. Avantini spoke about joint relationships between planning commissioners and consultants, and the shared responsibility for successful outcomes. CIB would like to continue their services; CIB knows how much it costs to service Wixom, and provided a bid that matches based on past years' data. CIB's hourly rates are competitive.

Chairman Day asked CIB which community is most similar in scope to Wixom. Ms. McIntyre answered South Lyon; Mr. Sprague answered Owosso. Both related to specific size of community.

Chairman Day inquired about the consultant role in economic development. Mr. Sprague answered they are in the assistance role; also, in an added capacity and expertise

perspective. Chairman Day inquired if the consultant should bring developers to Wixom. Mr. Sprague indicated they always recommend Wixom to developers, when possible.

Chairman Day inquired about the issues of conflict of interest with work in nearby communities. Mr. Avantini noted this situation is very rare but discloses to City Manager when this situation arises. In addition, CIB is very careful about what private work they take to ensure no conflicts of interest.

Chairman Day inquired about other experiences relevant to work in Wixom. CIB noted Fenton is another great example of a similar community that CIB has been engrained in, and has seen great development and growth over the years, especially in economic development. Chairman Day inquired about the services CIB provides to different communities and which of those services would they consider most similar to the services provided to Wixom.

Chairman Day also inquired about qualifications of project lead. Ms. McIntyre indicated she would be project lead, and be the presenter to the Planning Commission. CIB proposal recommended Mr. Sprague for ZBA and Mr. Avantini would have limited involvement.

Ms. McIntyre answered South Lyon; she provides office hours there also with Ms. Smith during the week in regards to site plans, attend Planning Commission, Zoning Board, and City Council meetings; and pre-development meetings.

Mr. Sprague answered he would add the City of Owosso, which is a community of about 15,000. They also attend ZBA, Planning Commission, and City Council meetings when needed.

Chairman Day asked what they see as their role in bringing or assisting the City with economic development.

Ms. McIntyre indicated they bring to Wixom ideas and evolving issues to see what is working and not working. Mr. Sprague indicated he has worked with City Manager Brown and Assistant City Manager Benson on projects. Mr. Sprague commented through their experience in Economic Development, Mr. Avantini started Economic Development in New York and he had spent eight years with business attraction and retention in Genesee County, as his primary career. CIB could provide that extra capacity in Wixom, if needed. Recently, CIB made the connection with the Detroit regional partnership for opportunities, as well. CIB is here to serve as an additional resource.

CIB works with developers in the private world, and whenever they see a good opportunity they may be interested in, they always notify them when that opportunity arises.

Chairman Day inquired if CIB works with communities that are close, graphically; and if so, if they find themselves in a position where there is a conflict as to which community to push for a specific project.

Mr. Avantini commented this situation is very rare, but would disclose to the City Manager, if this should arise. In addition, CIB is very careful about what private work they take to ensure no conflicts of interest.

Chairman Day inquired about other experiences relevant to work in Wixom. CIB noted Fenton is another great example of a similar community that CIB had been ingrained in, and has seen great development and growth over the years, especially in economic development.

Chairman Day asked what is Wixom's greatest assets and opportunities are from a land use/planning perspective. Mr. Avantini stated downtown Wixom is a key opportunity, as well as the properties along I-96. Mr. Sprague added the Air Line Trail as an additional asset that would provide huge dividends. Technical School and manufacturing base are crucial to Wixom's success. Mr. Sprague noted older buildings will slowly begin to turnover and redeveloped based on the attractive environment.

Chairman Day asked CIB to describe their experience with developing and implementing master plans.

Mr. Avantini commented that master plans are a large and changing environment. Due to scope, CIB will usually partner with other firms to do master planning projects due to changes in technology, graphics, and scope of what is included. Ms. Smith has experience with green energy technologies. The goal is to provide the best results, which is why they look to bring multiple partners to CIB. Mr. Sprague indicated the importance of a useful and functional master plan, as opposed to one that is thick and useful. CIB works hard to create useful streamline plans where the results are more important than chasing awards.

Chairman Day asked about the role of existing infrastructure in developing master plans. Mr. Sprague indicated infrastructure drives density, and areas for expansion. Infrastructure development is a policy choice, and investments should be directed towards desired areas. Mr. Avantini provided an example where a particular business wanted to locate in Wixom, but the City's limits in sewer capacity was a potentially limiting factor. Mr. Sprague discussed road capacity as another example. These experiences help in master planning processes to help inform infrastructure considerations. Mr. Avantini spoke about CIB and Wixom's efforts to be a business friendly as possible, and the pride taken.

Chairman Day asked about CIB's approach to community engagement, and to give an example of a unique community engagement technique their firm has implemented.

Mr. Avantini spoke about how community engagement has changed. CIB has some experience, but for expansive and unique needs, CIB looks to partner with others. Mr. Avantini gave an example of a mobile application for community engagement CIB has been looking to implement. Mr. Avantini thought digital tools are a game changer along with hybrid opportunities to be key. Mr. Sprague spoke about SWOT (Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, Threats) analysis for Genesee County economic development that was done in a hybrid format; and also real time feedback for greater engagement to meet where citizens are located.

Commissioner Tacy asked about Wixom's greatest challenge in planning/zoning. CIB noted generation gap between young and old in planning and zoning perspectives and land use expectations. Wixom's challenge will be to embrace these changing perspectives. Mr. Sprague said housing, transportation are key areas where general community opinions are changing. Mr. Sprague noted Wixom is losing developable acreage, and that density is becoming more desirable. There is a need for balance. Ms. McIntyre also noted the change in retail consumer habits, which is impacting land use. There are challenges with developing vacant land downtown, and finding alternative uses to fill those spaces besides traditional brick and mortar retail.

Commissioner Tacy inquired about Wixom's greatest challenge with in its standards with what is developed. Mr. Avantini indicated, in his opinion, we are hitting a generational gap. The older generation thinks differently than the next generation. The biggest challenge is for us to embrace that and move forward in a positive fashion. There is a lot of resistance out there. Mr. Sprague indicated there are three separate categories: housing, transportation using Uber or electric vehicles, charging stations; having 2,000 square foot homes, 4,000 square foot lots, that's major right now. The next generation does not want the yard to take care of, but still want the house like their parents. There is not a lot of room for traditional new development. Any new development moving forward, specific to residential, is going to have to go up as we see here, or have to be redeveloped in existing, older neighborhoods. This could be challenging. Ms. McIntyre noted spending habits in the way we purchase things, retail especially, has changed from the past several years. There will be changes in retail spaces and how we build and redevelopment some of our shopping centers and/or strip malls.

Chairman Day asked Ms. Smith about changes in generational perspectives on planning. Ms. Smith indicated housing and the missing middle types of housing that younger folks are desirous of, and is missing in many communities. Land uses are also changing. Ms. Smith noted her expertise in renewable energy and EV infrastructure, and the fact that more communities are seeing these requests in which communities need to develop standards. Mr. Sprague noted climate migration will also be an interesting trend for the Midwest, as availability of water in the West is getting more challenging.

Chairman Day asked for a recommendation for community push back to changing market trends. Mr. Sprague noted education, and putting housing prices and size in perspective when dense projects come forward. Mr. Avantini noted that the State of Michigan and MAP are talking more about affordable housing, and how to make wider varieties of housing options attractive to more community members is critical.

Chairman Day indicated Wixom is growing quickly in terms of population, but Wixom has struggled to gain momentum with developing the commercial aspects of our downtown district. Chairman Day asked CIB to describe their firm's experience and techniques for helping facilitate mixed use developments. Chairman Day indicated experience with Downtown Fenton is positive, but very different than Wixom based on local competition for projects. Mr. Avantini indicated that CIB has experience with mixed use developers to make connections and CIB is on the forefront of innovating funding options like tax increment financing to help make deals work. Mr. Avantini noted difficult property owners are a challenge that is hardest to get around. Mr. Sprague noted the need for vision.

Chairman Day asked CIB to tell the Commissioners about their experience keeping communities up to date with modern planning trends in assisting communities with updating their ordinances.

Ms. McIntyre commented CIB is always updating ordinances. Day to day uses of the ordinances gives them an indication of what needs to change as trends change; as the influx of residents change, they need to adjust and CIB does this for Wixom. CIB updates, and in addition of Ms. Hannah coming in natural resources, they include more environmental, natural resources focus, renewal energy, etc. Wixom has been very supportive. CIB presents ideas to Wixom, and gets their feedback. It is working in concert with the community, and planning commissioners. Mr. Avantini commented Ms. Maise is a great resource with industrial land uses.

Chairman Day asked how CIB views a growing community like Wixom fitting in with their current workload. Mr. Avantini commented he thought they would remain the same. CIB is built in such a way that they don't overwork their employees; they don't take on more work than they can handle; they turn down a lot of proposals. They are very careful and have always given Wixom the highest priority. There has never been a situation where they don't show up at a meeting or don't focus on what's being done in Wixom. They have always been passionate about their work in Wixom and will continue to do this in the future. Mr. Sprague agreed with Mr. Avantini's comment. He indicated they have always been passionate about their work in Wixom. He could not think of any other community that they have right now where all six of their team members plus their contractor is working in that community. CIB, intentionally, work for mid-size to smaller communities so they can manage their work load and are not stretched too thin.

Chairman Day inquired if CIB performs work for private client; if so, any work that could be considered a conflict of interest.

Mr. Avantini indicated there is no conflict of interest. Most of the other consultants do private sector work. They try to stay away from things that are a conflict. For the most part, CIB will fill out applications and help folks through the process. CIB will always talk about it with the communities beforehand and ask if there is an issue.

Chairman Day asked why Wixom should keep CIB as their planning consultants.

Mr. Avantini answered, hopefully, Wixom has been happy with the services they have provided for over 21 years. CIB would like to think that they have provided Wixom with great services and CIB has enjoyed working here. It has been a mutual and beneficial relationship. CIB has worked with Wixom to create some cool things and they would like to see them through fruition into the coming years. CIB has transitioned their firm and built themselves in such a way to keep going on and on. Ms. McIntyre indicated the team players are their greatest resources with their knowledge and history which cannot be replaced. Mr. Sprague commented CIB is not a traditional planning/zoning consulting company; they are an ongoing consulting company. They don't have 45 planners or 35 planners but they do have excellent planners that have a broad spectrum of knowledge from economic development to environmental and alternative energy to private sector development to traditional master plans and zoning ordinances, and relationships across the table. This is what separates CIB from other companies. Mr. Avantini commented Wixom will never be a lower priority in their minds.

Chairman Day commented he appreciated everything CIB has provided, and they were forthright about when CIB would not include Mr. Avantini.

2. **PLANNING CONSULTANT INTERVIEW – CARLISLE, WORTMAN & ASSOCIATES**

Discussion:

Assistant City Manager Benson introduced Ben Carlisle and Doug Lewan from Carlisle, Wortman and Associates, who is the other bidding perspective firm for planning and zoning services.

Mr. Lewan gave background information of Carlisle, Wortman and Associates. He said they were a community planning firm located in Ann Arbor, Michigan. Carlisle, Wortman and Associates has been in existence since 1988; their stock and trade is municipal community planning. They represent approximately 70 communities in SE Michigan. The firm in Ann Arbor has fourteen planners and two landscape architects. They are, if not, the largest planning firm in the State of Michigan. They do not represent private

developers. The company President, Dick Carlisle, made a decision decades ago to only represent municipal clients. There are no worries about Carlisle, Wortman and Associates having a conflict of interest, of representing a developer or private development firm; they only represent places like the City of Wixom.

Mr. Carlisle commented they provide services to many communities throughout the State; they do not chase projects and turn away work and go with those communities they would like to work with, and have a good relationship. Carlisle, Wortman and Associates only works in Michigan and stay within an hour of their primary office in Ann Arbor.

Chairman Day inquired about their largest community they do work with. Mr. Lewan answered they have a broad range of clients; represent very large cities such as the City of Troy, who is one of their biggest clients. Mr. Carlisle indicated they work for the City of Troy, approximately 100,000 residents, with their day to day planning, city council meetings, developer use. They also work for the community of Lake Angelus with 250 residents. Their range of communities is very broad, very vast and very different. Mr. Carlisle, personally, works with the City of Ann Arbor. Mr. Lewan stated they look at themselves as being in this for the long haul, and represent clients from the small townships, farming communities to the City of Troy.

Chairman Day indicated he was curious to what makes Carlisle, Wortman and Associates interested in proposing their services for the City of Wixom. Mr. Lewan commented there is a lot going on in Wixom, this is the kind of community that they are looking to become involved in based on the community. There is a lot of redevelopment in the southern part of the city. They perform day to day consultation, working the front counter, going to planning commission meetings, doing reports, doing master plans, for cities such as Wixom. They have written dozens of zoning ordinances, and dozens and dozens of master plans. Carlisle, Wortman and Associates saw an opportunity with the City of Wixom to become their day to day planner, to be involved in every aspect of community planning and that's what they are interested in. Mr. Carlisle commented they like working in interesting places. There is a lot going on in Wixom and they think there is a lot more to be done to build on in the city.

Chairman Day asked if Wixom were to retain Carlisle, Wortman and Associates as planners, what could they tell us about their proposed project staff and experience with similar communities such as Wixom. Mr. Lewan indicated when they received the proposal, they sat down at their Principals meetings and started talking about who is going to represent Wixom. They wanted to be sure that the people they sent to Wixom would be very experienced planners. The team would include Mr. Lewan, who is the vice president of Carlisle, Wortman and Associates; Laura Kreps, who has been an employee for 20 years. Mr. Lewan and Ms. Kreps work together with several different communities; and Mr. Ben Carlisle. There is other staff, as well, that will help with GIS, and landscape architects. They are a very experienced team that could service a community like the City of Wixom. Ms. Kreps worked for the City of Monroe twenty years ago. Mr. Lewan

commented he thought this team is excellent and very experienced as planners. Mr. Lewan or Ms. Kreps will be present at the planning commission meetings. Mr. Carlisle added they have a principal in charge model on how they deal with clients. Mr. Lewan will be the principal in charge, contact person, for Wixom. They will not assign another planner or anyone else to work with Wixom. While they are the front faces in the future, that doesn't mean that would be the only experience that they will bring to the city.

Chairman Day inquired about Mr. Lewan's experience on the Commission side. Mr. Lewan indicated he was asked to speak at Wayne State University at an alumni event to speak about planning and his experience at Wayne State. As part of his presentation, Mr. Lewan calculated the number of night meetings he had attended; his calculation to planning commission, city council, zoning board of appeals meetings was seven days a week for five years, a conservative estimate; that's how many meetings he had attended.

Chairman Day asked what other communities does Mr. Lewan attend Zoning Board of Appeals meetings. Mr. Lewan answered he does not attend, currently, many ZBA meetings; he attends on request. He attends planning commission meetings for Scio Township, a fast-growing township, west of Ann Arbor; Oakland Township; Brandon Township; and he is a long-time planner for the City of Saline.

Chairman Day indicated the Wixom planning commission meetings are the first and fourth Mondays of the month, and if that would conflict with Mr. Lewan's current meeting schedule. Mr. Lewan answered there is a minor conflict with Scio Township, however, Ms. Kreps would back him up in Scio Township. Scio Township meets the second and fourth Monday of each month.

Chairman Day inquired about Wixom's greatest assets and opportunities from a land use/planning perspective. Mr. Lewan indicated, in his review of the current master plan, is Wixom's tax base, industrial tax base, in the southern part of the community. The businesses within Wixom are a huge asset. The VCA is another growing asset. Mr. Lewan was very impressed by the VCA as they drove through town. The basic tax base issue is a huge benefit to Wixom. Mr. Carlisle commented the economy is going to get bumpier, and he thought Wixom was well positioned to handle this. He thought Wixom's diverse mix of land use, industrial base and the success they've had with the former Wixom plant shows a strength core to Wixom. Mr. Carlisle was very impressed with the VCA and advised to keep the course, even if it takes longer than expected. He indicated the VCA is very impressive and takes time but Wixom will have a great success story in this area.

Chairman Day inquired about what they saw as obstacles to Wixom in terms of land use and planning. Mr. Carlisle commented, off the cuff observation, he does not work with Wixom daily, and he did not want to offend, but he would say there is a potential hiccup in the economy, so light industrial use is more of a struggle in the future; the biggest hiccup would be possibly the VCA and the course of how long it may take to build out; it

is not happening quick enough. It would be a shame not to see the VCA come to fruition, even if it takes a significant amount of time. Mr. Lewan added from his review of Wixom's website and master plan, the master plan hasn't been updated in a while, and that's a problem. Carlisle, Wortman and Associates is not familiar and does not have a great understanding of the strength, weakness opportunities of Wixom. He indicated it is time to update the master plan, a comprehensive update of the master plan. 2007 is the last version of Wixom's master plan. Mr. Lewan commented if they were chosen as the planners for Wixom, they would hold public vision sessions to hear from the residents, planning commission, and city council to listen to find out the weaknesses, and it is their job to help direct and address Wixom's weaknesses.

Chairman Day asked Carlisle, Wortman and Associates to describe their experience with developing and implementing master plans. Mr. Lewan answered they have done dozens and dozens of master plans throughout SE Michigan. They are familiar with the planning enabling legislation that allows cities to do a master plan, where there is one required opportunity for public input. They pride themselves on developing, implementing public input sessions tailored to the community. They want to hear from business owners, residential owners, commercial owners regarding the community, the strengths, weaknesses, etc. They have innovative ideas with public input and master planning. Mr. Carlisle indicated every community is different; they engage with the community; they tailor their approach to address the differences between you and other communities. Everything in the plan should come from a community input session, whether from the planning commission, city council, residents, or other stakeholders. There should be no surprises. Mr. Carlisle indicated a meeting with every community is different, their strategy would be different. They would get to know Wixom and the community. Mr. Lewan indicated is Carlisle, Wortman and Associates were chosen as Wixom's planners, they would get to know him. He started planning in '88, and he prides himself on being extremely nuts and bolts planning and zoning person.

Chairman Day indicated, in terms of master plans, what changes does the master plan consist of or how are they done over the five or ten years? Mr. Carlisle stated he has over 20 years of experience; there are significant changes in how they do master plans. First, much more community-based engagement process; grass roots rather than the top down. Close to half of the budget is spent on community. It is based on community wants or represent the community engagement aspect; different than ten or twenty years ago. The core hasn't changed with future land use, transportation plan, housing plan but they are getting much more into social issues in planning than in the past. The master plan should be an engaged document, graphically oriented, implementation focused, and something that you can use. Mr. Lewan indicated there are aspects that don't change at all, the basics. The basic of what you are allowed to do, what you allowed to do as planning commissioners and what the city council is allowed to do in the legislation. The master plan is first, and zoning second.

Chairman Day indicated something will happen in the community and somebody will ask, how did this happen? There were public meetings for public input that were widely advertised. Chairman Day inquired how they get people to pay attention. Mr. Carlisle stated Wixom is not unique to this problem. First, it is human nature that they don't show up unless it is in their backyard and you are invested. People are busier today than they have ever been, so it is difficult to come to a meeting. During the pandemic, virtual meetings were allowed which opened up opportunities and people were participating. There is some talk about changing the open meetings act to allow hybrid models or allow virtual as well as in person. This would be a big step forward. Everyone is going to show up to meetings because they are concerned and they are supporting projects. Mr. Carlisle gave Berkley as an example for a reputation of some opposition. They established a steering committee and put the two most vocal opponents on the steering committee to be a part of the process. They went through the process and understood form-based district, zoning, etc., and they were the biggest supporters of a new form-based district.

Chairman Day indicated Wixom is growing in terms of population, possibly the fastest growing city in the State, but Wixom struggles to gain momentum with developing the commercial aspects of the downtown district. Chairman Day asked what is their firm's experience and technique for helping facilitate mixed use development. Mr. Lewan stated they have done a lot of work promoting mixed use development. This is an issue that has come up in almost every community. Gone are the days of strict separation of uses. Some community are trying to promote mixed use developments in areas that make sense, major corridors, main streets, etc. The problem is zoning was written with the idea of separation of uses, so you don't get the organically grown downtowns that people like such as downtown Plymouth, Northville, Ann Arbor, etc. Carlisle, Wortman and Associates has implemented a formed base code in Saline to allow a residence above commercial next to an office next to industrial, in trying to promote more of how a downtown or commercial district form base code. Trying to find those locations where mixed use make sense and then another way to promote growth in those areas is to get out of their own way, try to remove some of those regulations and standards that are impeding development and allow developers to do what they do best which is to develop property. They would have to look at the ordinances to determine if there are things they could do to streamline to better promote mixed use, and better promote form-based code.

Chairman Day asked for Carlisle, Wortman and Associates to tell the Commission about their experience of keeping communities up to date with modern planning trends and assisting communities with updating their ordinances. Mr. Lewan indicated the planners try to keep up with current legislation, current core cases. If they think the city is not fully addressed or a law changes, they will notify the city what those issues are and work with the city attorney, work with the planning commission and, ultimately, city council to implement changes.

Chairman Day asked in terms of master planning or zoning district, what consideration or role does existing infrastructure play and how they go about making recommendations.

Mr. Carlisle inquired if Wixom has a capital improvement plan. Mr. Benson indicated the planning commission is not directly involved but they do have a ten-year capital plan that is reviewed and documented by City Council. Mr. Carlisle indicated it is an extremely important consideration for communities like Wixom where you are built out. There are some legacy infrastructure issues; and there is also a huge demand on new development. Downtown urban development is much different than doing development and land use in rural communities. One of the biggest issues are infrastructure issues. Mr. Carlisle indicated they work with HRC in a lot of communities and they work hand in hand with the consultants to make sure they do not suggest things that are out of scope with regards to infrastructure needs.

Chairman Day indicated there seems to be trends in development in what people want in the housing stock and residential development. He asked if Carlisle, Wortman and Associates have found if generational conflicts come into play in trying to work with the planning and land use development. Mr. Lewan indicated generational conflicts. Every community in Michigan is aging. Chairman Day asked if they have experienced if a developer comes in looking for smaller homes, higher density and there is a legacy population that is used to large lots, no sidewalks, more suburban look and getting pushback. Mr. Carlisle said yes, especially in communities like Wixom; to start with your planner and go through the planning process and educate the community as to why this is important. Not everyone is going to agree with at least they are part of the process, and they understand, so there are no surprises when it does come in. You have the right to tell the developer no. The plan needs to be followed, follow zoning and listen to the needs of the community and what they want. It is an education process. Mr. Lewan stated it starts with the master plan. Plan first, zone second.

Commissioner Tacy indicated she would like to approach the same question but from a different vantage point. Taking developers out of the equation, as Wixom looks to update their master plan, how does Carlisle, Wortman and Associates see Wixom in the future in terms of trends and what the next generation are looking for? Mr. Lewan commented they would start with the master plan with a series of background studies. Background studies would give trends, projections of where Wixom is going to be based on existing conditions, past conditions, and in the future. This would help direct things such as the population, the age of the population and trends to address those items based on their experience. This would also come from the master planning process from vision sessions from the residents. They are also aware of current general trends from smaller homes, and they would be in a good position to give Wixom options. Mr. Carlisle indicated differences from 20 years ago to today. The younger generation are worried about climate change; they want to be able to not have a car; they want to be able to walk to places. They are worried they can't buy a house and going to be renting or living in their parent's basement for the rest of their lives. Their concerns are different than many other generations. A lot of the older generation concerns are very similar with the cost of housing, access to services, not having transportation.

Chairman Day inquired how they view a growing community such as Wixom fitting in with their current workload. Mr. Carlisle commented they do not take on work that they can't do; they believe in long term relationships. Mr. Lewan would be the day to day person and he would be committed to being available to Wixom with plenty of other people in the background that could help with additional work, if it should come up. Mr. Lewan indicated they would not be here tonight if they could not service the city of Wixom. Mr. Carlisle commented Ms. Kreps could not attend tonight, as she is at another planning commission meeting.

Chairman Day asked what role they see Carlisle, Wortman and Associates having in the area of economic development. Mr. Lewan answered this is where Ms. Kreps shines. She has done DDA work and has a very good economic development background. They do commercial market analysis, and a fair amount of economic development. Mr. Carlisle indicated Ms. Kreps was a DDA director for a long time and has experience in this field. She is a specialist in terms of economic development.

Chairman Day asked if they perform any work for private clients, and if so, are there any areas Carlisle, Wortman and Associates work in that could be considered a conflict of interest. Mr. Lewan answered there is no conflict of interest.

Chairman Day inquired if they ever run into a conflict of interest between different community they represent. Mr. Carlisle indicated when you represent 80 communities in the State, there are going to be some share issues. They come up occasionally; more times than not, it is beneficial for that to happen because they know what communities can work out, common issues between the communities is not adversarial. In one instance, Carlisle, Wortman and Associates recused themselves from a particular project and hired a different consultant to handle a project. They did not feel comfortable representing their individual clients working together on that particular issue.

Chairman Day asked why Wixom should hire Carlisle, Wortman and Associates. Mr. Lewan indicated he would start with the nuts and bolts. They are, if not, the largest group, second largest community planning firm in the State of Michigan. They have a bench of planners, and landscape architects, if something unusual comes up. They can advise Wixom in good planning, and zoning practices. There is also a division of Carlisle, Wortman and Associates that does code compliance for construction. They are truly a full-service community planning firm that is unique in the fact that they do not do private work. Mr. Carlisle indicated this is a relationship business. His dad, Richard Carlisle, started the firm 40 years ago and have been in business for 40 years. They are committed to this profession, committed to these communities, committed to Michigan and they are committed to working with and for local government.

Chairman Day thanked Mr. Carlisle and Mr. Lewan for their time in attending this meeting.

Assistant City Manager Benson asked the Commission to share their thoughts. He commented Mr. Brown and himself have done reviews with their internal review team but they were interested in the Commission's thoughts and opinion.

Chairman Day indicated there were two very different proposals in terms of retaining and how that work. He indicated he did not have the expertise on how this works for the city. Chairman Day thought Mr. Carlisle had some really good answers to the questions. Chairman Day commented he was under the opinion that if it is not broke, don't fix it. He was happy with CIB, they have a good institutional memory; there is no learning curve there. Chairman Day stated he talked to Commissioner Cousineau earlier and he did not have the benefit of listening to the proposals but he said his inkling was to stick with the known and keep CIB.

Commissioner Tacy commented she tried to stay open minded, and after reading the packets, both approached with the philosophy that the master plan has to be an engaging document that is implementation focused. She was impressed with CIB, in which they talked about diversity that they bring to Wixom; if they don't have it, they will get it; they have a young person who represents the next generation. Wixom, as it looks now, is not necessarily what is going to be enticing for generations to come, Wixom has to acknowledge that as it moves forward to make sure Wixom is poised to be receptive and engaging for the next generation. The planners are the ones that are supposed to have the fingers on the pulse of what's happening nationwide and how it is going to affect us, what they are hearing and how legislation is changing.

Commissioner Lawrence commented he supported Commissioner Tacy's comments. With CIB, he thought it was a very diverse move on their part with hiring Ms. Smith. Commissioner Lawrence indicated the learning curve bothered him, as well; Wixom is in the middle of a lot of things going on especially with the VCA. CIB is embroiled in Wixom and they know every facet of it. Commissioner Lawrence stated he was leaning toward the comfort angle; the salesmanship of Carlisle, Wortman and Associates did not sell him.

Commissioner Carter indicated he did not have much to add to the comments. He stated he did like that Carlisle, Wortman and Associates is a bigger company that has a lot of resources to pull from, which is attractive; but also, with CIB, essentially, their entire company is working with Wixom every day. Commissioner Carter indicated he was more inclined to think that a smaller, more nimble organization like CIB would be more likely to communicate with each other to know what Wixom is doing, because they are always talking whereas, he did not know that planner number 42 is talking to planner number 12.

Assistant City Manager Benson commented they had no intentions of trying to sway this discussion one way or the other. The evaluation from the group regarding the two firms was pretty evenly rated in terms of their ability to handle the administrative side of things. They would feel comfortable with either option; there are some price differences and there are some capacity differences.

Call to the Public:

No public comments

Staff Comments:

No staff comments.

Commission Comments:

No Commission comments.

ADJOURNMENT:

This meeting of the Planning Commission was motioned and adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

Mona Freiburger
Recording Secretary